Learn to Discern in Schools

Boosting Immunity to Disinformation:
UKRAINIAN STUDENTS BETTER DETECT FALSE INFORMATION AFTER TEACHERS INTEGRATE MEDIA LITERACY INTO STANDARD SUBJECTS
EVERY MINUTE OF THE DAY, PEOPLE…

Send **12,986,111** texts

Watch **4,333,560** videos

Conduct **3,877,140** searches

Share **2,083,333** snaps

Send **473,400** tweets

Make **176,220** calls

Post **49,380** photos
TIME SPENT DOING COMMON ACTIVITIES

- Watching TV: 7 years, 8 months
- Social Media: 5 years, 4 months
- Eating/Drinking: 3 years, 5 months
- Grooming: 1 year, 10 months
- Socializing: 1 year, 3 months
- Doing Laundry: 6 months
Ukraine: Learn to Discern in Schools

GOAL
Support the next generation of Ukrainian media consumers to navigate complex information spaces, detect false information, avoid being manipulated, and make informed decisions.

L2D MODEL

- **Piloted in 50 schools** in Ukraine, reaching approximately 5,425 students in 8th and 9th grade
- **Integrated media and information literacy skills into existing curricula**, not a standalone course
- **Trained educators** on teaching media and information literacy components of revised curriculum
- Based on the successful **Citizen Media Literacy Project**
Survey of 858 students to examine media consumption habits.

Students who participated in our survey spend more than twice as much time per day on social networks than they do using traditional media sources.
What social networks do students use?

YouTube is the most popular for general usage and for receiving news.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Network</th>
<th>Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YouTube</td>
<td>86.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vk</td>
<td>45.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>39.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>27.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Network</th>
<th>Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YouTube</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vk</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>31.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite a ban on Russian social media networks in Ukraine, 45% of students still use Vkontakte at least once a week.
2 in 5 of respondents receive news through YouTube. YouTube can be an excellent educational resource, but its algorithms prioritize what is entertaining, not what is accurate.

"YouTube’s search and recommender algorithms are misinformation engines."¹

– Zeynep Tufekci, University of North Carolina

¹ [https://twitter.com/zeynep/status/915608049141915648](https://twitter.com/zeynep/status/915608049141915648)
Case Study: YouTube

- If you search “MH-17” on YouTube’s homepage, of the first 7 results; one will be a documentary from Kremlin-controlled RT; one is a conspiracy theory video claiming that the disaster was a false flag attack by Ukrainian forces; and one will be a video from a pro-separatist American video-maker.

- When you click on any of the conspiracy theory videos, similar videos will be recommended to you and appear on your YouTube homepage.
When presented with a false information on social media,

- one in sixty-six said they would look for a primary source.
- one in seventeen said they would cross check the information.
Half of the people said they have NEVER encountered a piece of information that they believe to be untruthful.

Only 39% of students could correctly differentiate between opinions, facts with a source and facts without a source.
Learn to Discern in Schools: Working groups

We created working groups to develop training materials for teachers: lesson plans, detailed exercises and tasks, presentations, materials for distribution to students.

15 Members:

- Teachers
- Journalists
- University professors
- Media trainers
- Media literacy experts
- Fact-checkers
History of Ukraine
World History
Manipulated narratives of historical events often used to color modern civic issues.

**Channels for integration:**
Work with historical sources and interpretations (films, blogs, web pages, scientific papers, articles, political image-making)

---

Ukrainian Language
Ukrainian Literature
The core pillar of these subjects is work with texts of all styles.

**Channels for integration:**
Analysis of messages, narratives (media messages), language manipulations, work with facts/influence of text ideas

---

Art
Visual context has predominant role in modern consumption, including manipulation through emotions, “eyewitnesses,” video testimonies, music, etc.

**Channels for integration:**
Work with different visual content
L2D-S Targets Skills and Ability to:

- Analyze and ask questions;
- Recognize emotional manipulation and evaluate emotional reactions;
- Identify unproven elements of a story;
- Use modern tools to cross-check and verify information;
- Analyze the context and causes surrounding an event or news item;
- Draw parallels between history and the present;
- Work with sources of information verification;
- Analyze how history shapes our culture and values;
- Express and defend opinions using facts;
- Search for and check different sources;
- Distinguish between bias, distortion, disinformation, and lies;
- Distinguish facts from opinions.
Урок № 08: Телебачення

Історія телебачення та його функції, структура та власники телеканалів, цензура, реклама, контент, цільова аудиторія

Дане тема є досвідченою та важливою з глядачів на те, що вони життєвіст від сьогодення активниму користувачу, тоді життєвим глядачам телебачення. Кожному глядачі та користувачу важливо знайти і розуміти основні принципи роботи телебачення, його обмеження та ризики, а також підійти до інформації про основні події/чоловіки.

Основні уявлення про глядацькі захисти, вимагаються вести урок в стилі джокею, щоб в учнів була можливість висловити свої думки та знання, ввій, за допомогою додаткових матеріалів, завдання та короткого теоретичного матеріалу будеться додавати уявлення та навички до вже існуючих.

Інформаційна грамотність:
Ця розробка компетентності: розвиток розуміння того, що на контент телебачення можуть впливати як зовнішні, так і інші джерела, а також формувати увагу учнів на важливості цього процесу. Учні fringe аналізувати контент телебачення та аналізувати усеву аудиторію, вивчати аналізувати та відображати важливі аспекти контенту телебачення. Учні будуть аналізувати і відображати взаємодію контенту телебачення.

Що необхідно підтвірити до уроку?
> Мультимедійний проект, комп'ютер та екран
> Презентація «Телебачення»
> Медіа-інформація
> Розподілення матеріалів відповідно до кількості учнів у класі:
  - «Кількість каналів в Україні» - бланк для заповнення
  - «Кількість телебачень в Україні» - відповідь
  - «Цільова аудиторія телебачення» - домашнє завдання
Урок 25. ФАКТ ЧИ СУДЖЕННЯ?

Поставте відмітку біля кожного речення, чи є воно фактом, чи судженням:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>№</th>
<th>Факт</th>
<th>Судження</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Training of Teachers

168 teachers at 50 schools have been trained in media literacy and in L2D-S Methodology

- 62% of teachers strongly agree that materials will help them to better teach.
- 71% of teachers think that new materials will be interesting for students.
- 18% agree that materials will create additional obstacles in their work, which are mainly related to lack of equipment and time.
L2D-S Implementation
I really want to share my impressions. The lesson was great! Results exceeded all expectations. Students surprised me with their creativity, non-conventional thinking and original ideas. All they need is a slight push, then you can step out to watch and enjoy! It is exactly what I did.

Teacher from Dnipro
Evaluation Questions

Did students who received the L2D-enhanced curricula have higher media literacy skills at the end of the semester compared to students in the control group?

Did students who received the L2D-enhanced curricula report healthier media consumption habits and behavior at the end of the semester compared to students in the control group?

Were there any differences in media literacy skills between girls and boys?
## Evaluation Methodology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline survey</th>
<th>Endline survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Data collection period</strong></td>
<td>September 10-14, 2018</td>
<td>December 17-21, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sample size</strong></td>
<td>4,003 (50% L2D, 50% control)</td>
<td>3,624 (50% L2D, 50% control)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Margin of error</strong></td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of schools</strong></td>
<td>17 L2D schools and 10 control schools (schools were randomly assigned by type of school within each city)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Control group approach** | • L2D schools exposed to L2D lessons  
• Control schools not exposed to L2D lessons |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part A: Testing knowledge &amp; skills</th>
<th>Part B: Self-report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Media analysis skill</td>
<td>1. Information behavior and consumption practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. News media knowledge</td>
<td>2. Sense of control over information consumption and behavior (Media Locus of Control)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Ability to distinguish facts and opinions</td>
<td>3. Most remembered/interesting lesson in the semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Ability to identify hate speech</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ability to identify a fake story</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Highlights

Compared to the control group, L2D participants were:

- Twice as likely to detect hate speech
- 18% better at identifying fake news stories
- 16% better at differentiating between facts and opinions
- 14% more knowledgeable about the news media industry
Students who received L2D lessons had statistically significant higher scores compared to students in the control group on all media analysis assessments.
Students who received L2D lessons had statistically significant higher rates of healthy information behavior and a greater sense of control over their media consumption compared to the control group.
Media Analysis Skill Assessment

Media Analysis measures ability to identify:

• Points of view
• Omitted information
• Intended audience
• The purpose of the story
• Facts vs. opinions
• How media messages are constructed

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula outperformed control group students by 11%.

Respondents analyzed a piece of disinformation about spinners written by the Academy of Ukrainian Press for this purpose.

News Media Knowledge Assessment (NMK)

NMK measures knowledge of:

- Ownership of major media outlets
- Editorial influence
- Difference between propaganda and valid information
- Censorship
- How to respond when exposed to potentially fake posts on social media

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula outperformed control group students by 14%

Ability to Distinguish Facts vs. Opinions

Measures the ability to determine whether a statement is:

- Fact without source
- Fact with source
- Opinion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The quality of life in countries with voluntary voting is much higher than in countries that have compulsory voting system.</td>
<td>Fact without source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is indisputable reality. Not being forced to vote is better for citizens’ quality of life.</td>
<td>Opinion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula outperformed the control group by 16%
Ability to Identify Hate Speech

Please read the title and first sentence of the article. What element(s) does it contain:

1. Objective reporting
2. Opinion
3. Hate speech
4. Censorship
5. Fake story
6. Other
7. I do not know

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula outperformed the control group by 114%
Ability to Identify a Fake Post

Please read the post. Is it an example of:

1. Objective reporting
2. Opinion
3. Hate speech
4. Censorship
5. **Fake story**
6. Other
7. I do not know

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula outperformed the control group by **18%**
Locus of Control (Sense of Control Over Media Consumption)

Level of agreement with statements about their own media consumption:

• If I am misinformed by the news media, it is my own behavior that determines how soon I will learn credible information.
• I am in control of the information I get from the news media.
• When I am misinformed by the news media, I am to blame.
• The main thing that affects my knowledge about the world is what I myself do.
• If I pay attention to different sources of news, I can avoid being misinformed.
• If I take the right actions, I can stay informed.

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula were 9% more likely to agree with these statements than the control group, indicating they felt a greater sense of control over information they consume.

Self-Reported Information Consumption

Level of agreement with statements about applying L2D skills:

• Identify vicious and harmful media content
• Ask questions when they consume information about current events
• Effectively use different tools to access the information, video, image or other data that they need
• Examine the structure and different elements of media messages that they consume
• Understand the consequences of sharing messages that contain disinformation or propaganda
• Protect themselves from hateful and harmful content
• Know how to differentiate between facts and opinions
• Question why information was created, shared and with what purpose

Students who received L2D-enhanced curricula were 12% more likely to agree with these statements than the control group
Additional results

• Students who received L2D enhanced curricula were 13% more likely to say they believe critical information consumption skills are useful in life, compared to control group students.

• Students who received L2D lessons were more likely to name L2D-enhanced subjects as their most memorable and interesting classes.

• Girls had bigger differences than boys between baseline and endline in the ability to separate fact from opinion, news media knowledge, and analysis skills.
Learn to Discern in Schools Scaling Up (10.2018-09.2021)

AIMS
To repeat and exceed the achievements of the L2D program, up to September 2021

- **2018 (PILOT)**
  - 50 schools
  - 4 cities
  - 5 subjects
  - 168 teachers participate
  - Reaching at least 3,500 students

- **2019 (YEAR 1)**
  - +100 schools (+50 from pilot=150 in total)
  - +2 subjects (+5 from pilot=7 in total)
  - At least 450 teachers participate
  - Reaching at least 7,500 students

- **2020 (YEAR 2)**
  - +250 schools (400 in total)
  - 1,250 teachers participate
  - Reaching at least 27,500 students

- **2021 (YEAR 3)**
  - +250 schools (650 in total)
  - +2 new subjects (9 in total)
  - 1,250 teachers participate (2,968 in total)
  - Reaching at least 40,000 students